

Review Team

The Mid Term review was performed by Mr. Saadat Ali, Development Consultant. The UNDP Pakistan has hired the national reviewer.

02 ID x00(0)68(r)-10.8 Saadat Ali 1.84268(a) 4.268(b) 10.1245(p) 21.4268(a) 10.8 (-) -10.10.33687824.1.84268(b) 1.8253W 81 Q gitt

Table of Contents

i	Introduction.....	13
	1.1 Purpose and Objectives of Mid Term Review.....	13
	1.2 Scope & Methodology	13
	1.3 Limitations to the MTR	14
	1.4 Structure of the MTR report.....	14
	.. Project Description and Backgroun	h58j443863(.)12.00187608(h551(ùe)2281(.)12.0081U







[Redacted text block]

[Redacted text block]







All the outputs are further sub-divided into sub-outputs with their respective indicators along with the baseline. The planned activity is elaborated by activity result and action to be taken.

The annual work plans of PAKSTRAN are discussed internally within the PMU and all the component implementation units, and finalized.

The annual work plan is submitted to Project Board for approval and decisions are made to achieve the project development results, best value money, fairness, integrity, and transparency.

Although, during the project board meetings an overview of progress report of work carried out during the preceding period is narrated by the National Project Manager (NPM) and Component Directors (CDs). However, there is a need that the progress reports presentations to Project Board (PB) should be moved objectively and it should be clearly mentioned what are the bottle necks which are affecting the project progress and how these should be resolved.

The Project Results Framework of PAKSTRAN's indicators, targets and their means of verification are quite elaborate.

However, based on the fact that the first BRTS in Pakistan i.e., Lahore Metro Bus Service is operational and Rawalpindi/Islamabad BRTS will be operational soon, time is required to design and implement BRTS in Multan/Faisalabad/Karachi. There is a2.9272(t)-10.577(i)0.3355

institutions that
commit financing
assistance to city
buses by Year 3

to finance through PPP

lessons learned
from workshops
in Punjab and
Sindh to be
conducted by
all CIUs;



There were considerable delays in start-up and implementation of the project as stated earlier. The causes of the above mentioned delays to the project implementation are as follow:

- Procedural delays between the Government of Pakistan and UNDP about signing of the initial project agreement.
- Problem with Implementing Partner (ENERCOC) (C)7.69013(O)6ors R(e)2.98it969013(C)7.69013(O)6

The project's initial assessment of the investment conditions for the buses was poor with private sector firms assuming large risks including lack of CNG fuelling stations, land for maintenance depots, risk of congested bus routes, vagueness of subsidy support and lack of a hedge against higher fuel

